# **EXHIBIT 6**



IN THE UNITED STATES DISRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

DONALD KOVAC,

Plaintiff

vs. . Civil Action No.:

2:09-CV-400

PENNSYLVANIA TURNPIKE

COMMISSION, MITCHELL RUBIN,

GEORGE HATALOWICH, MELVIN . TERRENCE F. MCVERRY

SHELTON and MARK ROWE,

Defendants

Deposition of: GEORGE HATALOWICH

Taken by : Plaintiff

Date : May 10, 2010, 10:14 a.m.

Place : 27 South Arlene Street

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania

By : Susan L. Petrilla, Reporter

Notary Public

1		
		8
1		to your understanding?
2	Α.	No.
3	Q.	Is the Turnpike Commission's annual operating
4		budget approved by any particular body?
5	Α.	It is approved by the Commission, yes.
6	Q.	And what is the fiscal year for the Turnpike?
7	Α.	It is June 1st through May 31st.
8	Q.	So if Don Kovac was terminated on November 20th
9		of 2008, which I think the record will show,
10		that was in the midst of a fiscal year. If that
11		was November of 2008, would you call that the
12		fiscal year 2008? How would you describe I
13		guess the question could be put, how would you
14		describe the fiscal year that begins on June 1st
15		of '08?
16	Α.	June 1st of '08 would be the 2008-2009 fiscal
17		year.
18	Q.	Simple enough. Is there a rhythm for the
19		preparation and presentation and approval of
20		annual operating budgets for the Turnpike
21		Commission so that those events tend to take
22		place at the same time year after year?
23	Α.	Yes.
24	Q.	Can you describe that for me?
25	Α.	It's basically the departments each begin to

		13
1		because of fuel prices and probably the
2		beginning of the recession at the time. So we
3		wanted to do all we could to keep costs as low
4		as possible and be as efficient as possible.
5	Q.	Did the operating budget that was proposed to
6		the Commission reflect a 10 percent decrease in
7		operating costs?
8	А.	I don't recall exactly what the decrease was.
9	Q.	Did it reflect a decrease, to your recollection?
10	Α.	I recall that it probably remained flat. We
11		were looking at the beginning of an increase, so
12		it probably remained flat.
13	Q.	So you're saying you avoided an increase that it
14		looked like you were headed for for that fiscal
15		year. Is that a fair summary?
16	Α.	Yes.
17	Q.	I had asked you whether there was an approved
18		operating budget in place for fiscal year '08-09
19		by certain dates that we talked about. I'd like
20		to back up and ask you, do you recall whether a
21		completed proposed budget was presented to the
22		Turnpike Commission prior to June 1st of '08?
23	Α.	I do recall that we presented a budget, yes.
24	Q.	And was that budget substantial I'm sorry,
25		strike that. Was that budget the one that was

		29
1		fiscal '08-09 was submitted to the Turnpike
2		Commission?
3	A.	I don't recall the exact date, but it would have
4		been after we went through and made all the
5		possible reductions we could have made.
6	Q.	So a submission wasn't even made until after Don
7		Kovac had already been let go. Is that the
8		chronology?
9	Α.	I don't think that there was a formal
10		submission, no. We, again, start with a budget
11		and continue to make reductions in it as we try
12		to reduce the overall. So it's a process, it's
13		not something that just happens one time.
14	Q.	In prior years, was it the practice of the
15		Turnpike Commission to have a budget in place
16		for a fiscal year before the first day of the
17		fiscal year?
18	Α.	That's always the objective, but some years, it
19		just doesn't happen.
20	Q.	In your knowledge, how many years has it been in
21		place before day one versus how many years has
22		it not been in place before day one?
23	Α.	I couldn't tell you exactly how many. I would
24		think the majority of them we had in place
25		before day one, but I'm sure there were others
	i	

		32
1	Q.	Was there any discussion at that meeting of Don
2		Kovac and his position?
3	Α.	I don't think we discussed Don Kovac
4		specifically being the only position discussed.
5		I believe we presented all 15 or so positions
6		and made sure the Commission was aware that
7		these were the positions that were being
8		recommended for elimination.
9	Q.	Do you know an individual by the name of Melvin
10		Shelton?
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	Is he an employee of the Turnpike Commission?
13	Α.	Yes, he is.
14	Q.	What's his job title?
15	Α.	I can't recall his exact job title.
16	Q.	In general, what does he do for the Turnpike
17		Commission?
18	Α.	He does some labor negotiations and dealings
19		with the union and the majority of the
20		grievances and arbitrations, labor negotiations
21		with Local 77.
22	Q.	Was that true in 2008?
23	Α.	Yes.
24	Q.	To whom does Melvin Shelton report?
25	Α.	Operationally, he would have reported to

		3	33
1		Mr. Kovac.	
2	Q.	To whom does he report now?	
3	Α.	I believe it's to the Eastern Regional Office	
4		director. And, now that I think about it, at	
5		the time in '08, I don't recall if he	
6		organizationally on an organizational chart,	
7		excuse me, reported to Don or reported to the	
8		Eastern Regional Office director, but his duties	
9		were to do labor relations.	
10	Q.	Do you know what Mr. Kovac's salary was at the	
11		time of his termination?	
12	А.	I don't recall exactly, but I believe it was in	
13		the \$80,000 range.	
14	Q.	What about at the same time what Mr. Shelton's	
15		salary was?	
16	Α.	I don't recall exactly. Now that I'm thinking	
17		about it, maybe Mr. Shelton was in the 80,000	
18		and Don was in the \$90,000 range.	
19	Q.	Were you aware of any conflicts or difficulties	
20		between Mr. Shelton and Mr. Kovac?	
21	Α.	From time to time, I do recall some conflicts	
22		and difficulties, yes.	
23	Q.	How did those come to your attention?	
24	Α.	Usually, Mr. Shelton would mention them to me.	
25	Q.	Did anyone else bring the subject to you other	
_			

			36
1		retirements or	
2	Q.	So there's been turnover, then, in the union	
3		workforce. Has there been any increase in the	
4		union workforce?	
5	Α.	No, I don't believe so.	
6	Q.	Has there been any increase in the nonunion	
7		workforce?	
8	Α.	I know we've hired some people again for	
9		positions that were vacated for retirements or	
10		somebody leaving for whatever reason.	
11	Q.	What about positions added?	
12	Α.	I do believe there are a few new management	
13		positions based on need for whatever the task i	s
14		that we hired them to do.	
15	Q.	How many?	
16	Α.	I don't recall an exact number of how many.	
17	Q.	Can you tell me what any of those new positions	
18		are?	
19	Α.	I don't know. I can't recall off the top of my	
20		head.	
21	Q.	In the management workforce, are you aware of	
22		whether there have been any raises given to	
23		management employees since the fall of 2008?	
24	Α.	I believe there were some equity adjustments fo	r
25		when somebody takes on more responsibility or a	
	Ī		

		37
1		department is reorganized to improve efficiency
2		production.
3	Q.	Any equity adjustments in any other
4		circumstances than the two that you've just
5		described?
6	Α.	I don't recall.
7	Q.	Now, you used the phrase "equity adjustments."
8		Can you define that for me?
9	Α.	I believe that's the term that's used when a
10		person is given more job duties than their job
11		description called for, because of either a
12		reorganization or a restructuring for efficiency
13		reasons.
14	Q.	Would that be a salary increase exclusively or
15		would there be other factors?
16	Α.	Some can be a salary increase. If duties are
17		taken away, it could be a salary decrease.
18	Q.	Would there be other elements of compensation
19		that are adjusted in an equity adjustment?
20	А.	When you say other elements of compensation, I'm
21		not sure what you mean. Other than a salary?
22	Q.	Yes. A change in pension formula, a different
23		vehicle, the addition of some other benefit
24		provided by the Turnpike Commission?
25	Α.	I don't think so.
	-	-

		48
1		number and asked them, you know and what time
2		he had departed Central Office. So we assumed
3		somebody driving at, you know, 60 or 65 miles an
4		hour would be pretty much at a certain location.
5		And, sure enough, they were able to locate him
6		and stop him and ask him to call his supervisor.
7	Q.	You contacted the state police lieutenant and
8		gave her some information. What was your
9		instruction to her?
10	Α.	To see if we could get the vehicle stopped and
11		explain to Mr. Kovac to call his supervisor.
12	Q.	Did you give any instruction as to the manner of
13		trying to get the vehicle stopped?
14	А.	No, I left that up to the state police. But I
15		did explain to the lieutenant the situation we
16		were dealing with. That she was aware that we
17		were eliminating these positions and had these
18		exit interviews scheduled, and that he had left
19		before we could have his exit interview.
20	Q.	Did she say anything back to you?
21	Α.	Other than she understood and she's not
22		guaranteeing that they could find him, because
23		we really don't know if he got off the system
24		or you know, there was no there was no
25		guarantee that we could get him stopped. So she